

BOOK REVIEWS

Raymond F. Collins. *Wealth, Wages, and the Wealthy: New Testament Insights for Preachers and Teachers*. A Michael Glazier Book. Collegeville, MN: Liturgical Press, 2017. xix + 347 pp. \$34.95. ISBN 978-0-8146-8784-0.

Ray Collins has achieved six decades of scholarly work on the New Testament and is still going strong. I have known him as a student and a colleague; and besides the fact that I am seriously impressed with his academic prowess, one of the things that I admire most about his work is that he is a first class teacher. He never lectures ‘at you’ and he doesn’t overwhelm you with more material than you know what to do with. He guides, explains, and helps you understand things from a perspective that you probably haven’t thought of before. He does the same when he is writing articles and books.

His latest book, ‘for pastors and teachers’, is really for anyone who is willing to be confronted with the ‘good news’ of the gospel. The project of this book is inspired by two people who have alerted him to the fact that we might have missed something when we think we have understood the gospel. The first is Pope Francis whose encyclical, *Laudato Si*, had the courage to raise issues about wealth and the economic state of our world. It was evident from some of the strong reactions that followed that many would prefer not to hear what Jesus and his disciples have to say about these matters. The second is John Howard Yoder whom he observes lamenting “that Christian ethical teaching has largely ignored Jesus” (*The Politics of Jesus*, 1972).

Collins is no stranger to ethical discourse. His *Christian Morality: Biblical Foundations* (Notre Dame, IN: University of Notre Dame Press, 1986) and *Sexual Ethics and the New Testament: Behavior and Belief* (New York: Herder and Herder, 2000) have been valuable resources for my work in moral theology. The first of these includes an important exegesis of a crucial passage, “‘And why not do evil so that good may come?’ A Commentary on Romans 3:7-8” (pp. 238-53), that should be studied not only by ethicists but especially by the occupants of the teaching office in the church who have been abusing the phrase for decades.

The book contains nine chapters followed by nineteen pages of ‘concluding thoughts’. The first chapter is simply about Paul, whose writings are apparently the oldest in the NT corpus, followed by a study of what Paul has to say about the topics. Chapters three to seven cover the Gospels and Acts, and the remaining three are on the Deutero-Pauline Texts, the Catholic Epistles, and the Johannine Corpus. In each instance, Collins provides the reader with a background of the author and the circumstances within which they wrote. I found this to be a very beneficial tool for becoming familiar with their works.

Any student of theology who has had to sit through the exposition of minute detail about particular biblical passages as a form of ‘exegesis’ will appreciate that Collins titles the last section of every chapter, ‘So What?’ In each of these he contrasts the core of the passages he just covered with stories of greed or hoarding wealth taken from regular news services and quotations from the writings and homilies of Pope Francis. The point here is not simply the relevance of the ‘good news’ found in the New Testament but also the observation of how little we hear these passages being quoted and explained in preaching and teaching. I hope that this book will find its way into the hands of those who need to hear – and proclaim – its message.

Joseph A. Selling
KU Leuven

Stefan Alkier and Annette Weissenrieder, eds. *Miracles Revisited: New Testament Miracle Stories and Their Concepts of Reality*. Studies of the Bible and Its Reception 2 (Berlin and Boston, MA: De Gruyter, 2013). 414 pp. €120.00. ISBN 978-3-11-029592-4.

A number of recent studies, including the *Kompendium der frühchristlichen Wundererzählungen*. Band I: *Die Wunder Jesu* (Gütersloh: Gütersloher Verlagshaus, 2013) indicate that miracles, broadly defined, are attracting more attention in the current scholarly discussion. While some of the old questions are still being discussed (and are unlikely to go away), new questions are raised, traditional assumptions are questioned, new methods are employed and the focus is becoming broader. This collection of essays bears witness to these developments. The greater part of the essays had their origin in a conference organised by the editors on “Healing Stories and Concepts of Reality from Antiquity to the Middle Ages” held at San Francisco Theological Seminary in November 2011. In the preface, Stefan Alkier and Annette Weissenrieder describe the focus of the volume as follows: “Through the study of miracles, the contributors in this volume show how unique perspectives to the history of antiquity are made possible with many consequences: as the first argument, miracles allow us to establish new directions in the debate about concepts of reality in antiquity and beyond” (1). They note that the interpretation of miracle stories has been dominated in the West by the binary distinction of fact versus fiction. Even in recent research this modern opposition appears as self-evident. However, “In order to overcome an impediment to research presented by this opposition of terms, between fact and fiction, supernatural and natural events, the authors in this volume ask about the changing use of miraculous events in religious as well as secular systems of thought and knowledge” (1). In addition, miracles allow us to thematise and historicise the social constitution, assumptions of normality and boundaries in and between epistemic systems. The editors note that reality and epistemology were not first disputed in modernity, but scathing criticism of miracles and sympathising scepticism appeared in close proximity to each other, already in antiquity. A fresh study of miracles also allows for the new substantiation of theoretical issues which have already been discussed. Due to

the predominance of form criticism, which dominated the debate not only in New Testament studies, the discourse on miracles was confined to questions of their historicity. In this discourse the restriction to individual pericopes also led to a neglect of the macro-texts. The essays of this volume attempt not only inquire into the macro-context more strongly than has been customary in research, “but also expand the miracle-discourse to genres such as letters, histories, and apocalypses, to do justice to these extraordinary perspectives, which occur alongside the interface of epistemic systems” (1). The goal is an interdisciplinary conversation which goes beyond the limits of antiquity and identifies further traces. The preface does not introduce the essays or provide a survey of research. There are no abstracts. While I list all contributions, I will concentrate on the essays which relate directly to the New Testament.

Part one is devoted to rereading New Testament miracle stories. It contains the following essays:

Stefan Alkier, “‘For nothing will be impossible with God’ (Luke 1:37): The Reality of ‘The Feeding of the Five Thousand’ (Luke 9:10-17) in the Universe of Discourse of Luke’s Gospel” (5-22; Alkier discusses fact, fiction and friction and the semiotic concepts of the universe of discourse and the *encyclopedia* as an all-embracing cultural sign relation; there is a reading of Luke 9:10-17 in the universe of discourse of Luke’s Gospel, other sections are entitled “Jesus is not a Shaman or: How the Feeding of the 5000 worked according to the Gospel of Luke” and “Guidelines for a theological interpretation of the feeding story”); Michael Rydryck, “Miracles of Judgment in Luke-Acts” (23-32; it is impossible to identify miracle-like phenomena of judgement by methods of form-criticism; discussion of these underrated or even ignored miracle-like-phenomena includes description of some aspects of a hermeneutics of miracles based upon an extrabiblical example taken from popular culture and interpreted in patterns of theological exegesis; these miracles are “complementary to healings, exorcisms, and stories of liberation. Restoration and judgement are closely connected in God’s action to impose his eschatological reign. Miracles occur on the frontier between the divine and the human dimension of possibility,” 32); Philip Erwin, “Epiphany Reconsidered: A Parallel Reading of Acts 9:1-9 and Iliad 188-224a” (33-53; reading the conversion/calling of Saul as an epiphany; epiphanies have the effect of transforming one’s fidelity to a particular deity; Saul’s epiphany in Acts 9:19 functions to prevent Saul’s imminent violent action by introducing alternative motivating factors that (re)direct his subsequent actions) and Elaine M. Wainwright, “Of Dogs and Women: Ethology and Gender in Ancient Healing. The Canaanite Woman’s Story – Matt 15:21-28” (55-69; while this healing story continues the storyline of Jesus as healer bringing in the kingdom of heaven, “it extends healing to include the socio-cultural stigmas borne on the gendered bodies of the two females in this narrative and the demon-possessed body of the daughter, but not without the struggle of challenge and riposte,” 68).

Three essays in *part two* relate miracle stories and ancient medical discourse: Annette Weissenrieder (“Stories Just Under the Skin: *lepra* in the Gospel of Luke,” 73-100) discusses the body construct of “skin,” the illness construct of *lepra* in antiquity, early Christianity and ancient “rational” medicine and the illness construct *lepra* in Luke 17. Weissenrieder argues that “In using the illness *lepra* and not negotiating the ritualistic aspect connected with this

illness, the Gospel of Luke expressed admiration for the Samaritans. The illness *lepra* is not seen here as a boundary marker that focuses on the otherness as exclusion but rather as a sign that represents fluctuating borders, like the place where Jesus encounters the ten lepers, the geographical region between Samaria and Galilee, or the understanding of *allogenes*. The main focus of the story is the different way of seeing which initiated healing and honouring God" (100).

Teun Tieleman examines "Miracle and Natural Cause in Galen" (101-113) and Christopher Ocker, "The Physiology of Spirit in the Reformation: Medical Consensus and Protestant Theologians" (115-157).

Part three addresses the politics of miracle stories and contains four essays: Sharon Betcher, "Disability and the Terror of the Miracle Tradition" (161-181; when worked through theological analysis and postcolonial-disability studies, the miracle accounts serve as metonyms for resisting empire; this challenges readers to appreciate miracle stories in such a way as to reverse the assumed normalisation of bodies, which makes them complicit with cultural horizons of labour and consumer value); James A. Noel, "Miracle and Eschatology in Two African American Slave Narratives and the Spirituals: From 'Orality' to Text" (183-199); Annette Weissenrieder, "Cultural Translation: The Fig Tree and Politics of Representation under Nero in Rome (Mark 11:13-15, 19-20; Matthew 21:18-19; Luke 13:1-9)" (201-231; survey of the image of the fig tree in the history of interpretation, cultural translation, or the performative character of translation, the fig tree as an emblem for the founding of Rome, its founding fathers, and the war goddess Roma, the cultural translation of the fig tree in Matthew, Mark and Luke; Weissenrieder suggests that "the narrative of the fig tree in Mark and Matthew tells a contrasting story: the symbol for Rome's global power is withered down to the root and will not bear any more fruit. And just as the coins remind us of the foundation myth, the story of the withered tree may remind us of the coming downfall of Rome," 230; the story is open to transferring the imagery from one culture to the other, from Rome to Jerusalem) and Hartmut Leppin, "Imperial Miracles and Elitist Discourses" (233-248).

Part four focuses on the depiction of miracles in different epochs and media: Norbert Zimmermann, "The Healing Christ in Early Christian Funeral Art: The Example of the Frescoes at Domitilla Catacomb/Rome" (251-274); Rossitza Schroeder, "The Rhetoric of Violence and Healing in the Church of Prophites Elias in Thessaloniki" (275-292) and Stefan Alkier, "The Wondrous World of the Cinema: Types of Depictions of the Miraculous in Jesus Films" (293-311).

The four essays in *part five* aim at rethinking the miraculous: Stefan Alkier, David Moffitt, "Miracles Revisited: A Short Theological and Historical Survey" (315-335; tracing the changing conceptions of miracles from early Christianity through the form critical methodology of the 20th century, "new" solutions in the study of miracles: between historicising and neorationalism, remarks on the debate over miracles in English language scholarship during the 20th century, the debate over miracles and the necessary problematising of concepts of reality). Alkier concludes: "There is no simple "solution" to the problem of miracles. Indeed, it is not the "solution" to the question of miracles that offers us a promising historiographical, philosophical, exegetical, or theological way forward, but rather the openness that the question demands. This

latter approach exposes fundamental questions and problems that scientific discourse can only dismiss or reduce to its own detriment and to the detriment of society. The problem of miracles must be addressed in new ways, and indeed in ways that move beyond the demythologizing and rehistoricizing methodologies. Only exegetical approaches that work within the dominant conceptions of reality are able to support both learned and pious miracle discourse in our pluralistic societies” (334).

The other essays are: Werner Kahl, “New Testament Healing Narratives and the Category of Numinous Power” (337-349); the sections of this essay are: the numinous – an unpredictable career of a category, “numinous power” as a useful category, numinous power and concepts of reality, the theological significance of New Testament miracle healing stories as narrative expressions of the nearness of the kingdom of God; “the miracle stories can be read as paradigmatic narratives communicating manifestations within the parameters of this world of the all-inclusive salvation of God,” 349); Heiko Schulz, “The Concept of Miracle and the Concepts of Reality: Some Provisional Remarks” (351-375) and Hermann Deuser, “Marvels, Miracles, Signs and the Real: Peirce’s Semiotics in Religion and Art” (377-390).

The volume closes with indices of subjects and persons, of biblical sources and of modern authors. An excellent supplementary volume is Tobias Nicklas & Janet E. Spittler, eds., *Credible, Incredible: The Miraculous in the Ancient Mediterranean*, Wissenschaftliche Untersuchungen zum Neuen Testament 321 (Tübingen: Mohr Siebeck, 2013).

Christoph Stenschke
Biblisch-Theologische Akademie Wiedenest
University of South Africa, Pretoria

Itzhak Benyamini. *Narcissist Universalism: A Psychoanalytic Reading of Paul’s Epistles*. New York: Bloomsbury T&T Clark, 2014. x + 121 pp. \$39.95. ISBN 978-0-567-12393-0.

Scholars in theology and philosophy tend to be hesitant and sceptical when it comes to studies in applied psychoanalysis – and with good reason. In this study, Lacanian psychoanalytic thought is used as a tool for an enquiry into Paul’s epistles that moves beyond the common positive-historical, philological, and sociological approaches in order to uncover the kernel of unconscious thought that is at the heart of Paul’s various writings. Such methods and aims are not without problems. They imply the presentation of psychoanalytic theory and method as consistent and coherent, or, in other words, in its “dogmatic” form. Furthermore, the claim is not so much that psychoanalysis can help to uncover the unconscious core of texts, but more fundamentally, that these texts have an unconscious kernel – which may of course be disputed. Having said this, the author, who is well informed by biblical scholarship, has succeeded in composing a creative and innovative study in which the possibility and limitations of an applied psychoanalysis are examined and Lacanian key concepts adjusted when necessary. In this way this study clearly exceeds Lacan’s

reflections on the relationship between law, desire, and transgression in the epistle to the Romans. Instead, this study primarily deals with Paul's emancipatory thought on Christian rituals – the Lord's supper, baptism – and the tenet "love thy neighbour as thyself" in service of the founding of a communal identity that is not regulated by external rituals and laws, but by internalised ones relative to interpersonal relations. At the heart of this community the author finds an imaginary "narcissistic" identification with Christ both on an individual level (faith) and a collective level (body of the community). Christianity distinguishes itself from Judaism and paganism not by introducing alternative symbolic laws and rituals defining a particular group, but by adhering to a different psychological structure expressed in universal terms (sin, faith, love). At this point, this study connects to contemporary philosophical reflections on Paul's epistles – Taubes, Badiou, Žizek, and others. This book thus makes an interesting contribution to the contemporary philosophical and theological interest in Pauline thought.

Herman Westerink
Radboud University Nijmegen

Andrew Meszaros. *The Prophetic Church: History and Doctrinal Development in John Henry Newman and Yves Congar*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2016. xvi + 268 pp. £65.00. ISBN 978-0-19-878634-4.

The context in which this important book appears is one in which many Catholic theologians deny that the Church faithfully mediates the enduring cognitive content of divine revelation. In light of Newman's work, Meszaros examines Congar's understanding of how the Church as an "active subject" develops Christian doctrine about divine revelation. For Congar, dogmas are not mere human constructions but rather express the true nature of reality as revealed by God. At the same time, however, the Church as "active subject" benefits from theological speculation and from Christian experience as a whole. The Holy Spirit enables the Church to perceive the homogeneity of a doctrinal judgment with the apostolic deposit of faith. The Church is aided in this perception by historical retrieval of "monuments of Tradition," as well as by apprehending "the Church in her entirety" (104).

In an especially notable fifth chapter, Meszaros explores the role that history plays in doctrinal development. As Meszaros says, Congar emphasises the way in which the course of world history and of the specific history of the Church influences the timing and phrasing of particular dogmatic formulations. The Church not only responds to events and ideas in the world, but also benefits from them. Yet, if history both conditions and directs the path of doctrinal development, "how is one to lay hold of the truth *now* when future shifts are theoretically possible?" (183). For Congar, the answer is never to deny or minimise the role of history, or to suppose that there is not non-definitive discontinuity, regression, provisional statements, and partial errors along the winding path of the centuries. On the grounds of historical realism, Congar favours an episodic rather than linear view of the path of doctrinal development. But

Congar insists upon the Church's ability to identify enduringly true "articulations of the faith that regulate subsequent development" (193) and therefore to perceive the indefectible continuity or homogeneity of definitive Catholic teaching with the apostolic deposit of faith.

Much more could be said, especially about Meszaros' richly constructive account in his final chapter of "the prophetic Church in history" and the "Doctrinal Economy." In the current conflict between idealistically ahistorical approaches to Catholic doctrine and reductively historicising approaches, Meszaros' superb book sets out the salutary ground.

Matthew Levering
Mundelein Seminary

Ward De Pril. *Theological Renewal and the Resurgence of Integrism: The René Draguet Case (1942) in Its Context*. Bibliotheca Ephemeridum Theologicarum Lovaniensium 266. Leuven, Paris and Bristol, CT: Peeters, 2016. xlv + 333 pp. €85.00. ISBN 978-90-429-3036-0.

The present work constitutes the publication in English of the doctoral thesis defended by Ward De Pril January 14, 2010 at the Faculty of Theology and Religious Studies of the Catholic University of Louvain (KU Leuven), under the title *De Leuvense theoloog en orientalist René Draguet (1896-1980): Studie van zijn theologische positie en zijn conflict met de kerkelijke overheid*. The author had already made a brief presentation in 2015 in another Louvain-based review: "The Resurgence of Integrism: The Action of the Holy Office against René Draguet," *Ephemerides Theologicae Lovanienses* 91, no. 2 (2015): 295-309.

On 1 July 1942, the Holy Office deprived, without explaining itself, René Draguet (1896-1980), professor of fundamental theology at the Faculty of Theology of Louvain, of his teaching position. That condemnation followed the placing on the Index, the preceding February 6, of two works with at first glance a seemingly different appearance: that of the Belgian Dominican Louis Charlier (1898-1981), professor at the house of studies of his order in Louvain (*Essai sur le problème théologique*, Thuillies, Ramgal, 1938), and that of his French confrere Marie-Dominique Chenu (1895-1990), regent of studies at the convent of the province of France installed at Kain-la-Tombe (Tournai) in 1904 (*Une école de théologie, le Saulchoir*, Tournai: Casterman, 1937). And like Draguet, the two Dominicans censured in February were soon deprived of their teaching positions, amounting to quite a few sanctions in a short period of time, too many for not seeing a clustered shot against a hypothetically deviant theological current (the "new theology") and a resurgence of "integrism."

Already partially analysed by Étienne Fouilloux and Robert Guelluy in the years 1985-1986, this affair has been systematically reworked by the author, notably thanks to the contributions of documents maintained by Draguet which only recently became available. In fact, Draguet, who never accepted his condemnation, immediately began a tenacious struggle for his rehabilitation, which he obtained partially in 1948 (when the Holy Office accepted his re-entry into the Faculty of Theology, but without giving courses there) and completely in

1965, a struggle that he had patiently negotiated and carefully documented through a dossier which he systematically closed in 1977, in specifying that it should only be made public twenty years after his death (see the presentation of these Draguet papers preserved at the Faculty of Theology of KU Leuven, on pp. 141-143). That is not the only original contribution of this solid study, the second part of which utilises this original documentation to its advantage in retracing anew, on the one hand, the contours of the condemnation (chapter I, p. 145-249) and on the other his two-fold rehabilitation in 1948 and in 1965, respectively (chapter II, pp. 251-302 and 302-318). The first part is also, in effect, innovative in reviewing and profoundly analysing the writings of Draguet, already presented summarily by Guelluy in 1986. That affords us a better understanding of the Louvain professor's position (chapter I, pp. 11-84), before providing a detailed analysis of the *Essais* by Charlier and attempting to measure its convergences and variations vis-à-vis Draguet's thought and, to a lesser degree, with Chenu's (85-136).

Luc Courtois
Université catholique de Louvain

Matthew A. Rothaus Moser. *Love Itself Is Understanding: Hans Urs von Balthasar's Theology of the Saints*. Minneapolis, MN: Fortress Press, 2016. xxxii + 319 pp. \$79.00. ISBN 978-1-451-49959-9.

The history of Christianity is coloured by the lives of the saints. Lauded for their exemplary imitation of Jesus, and their ability to revive and inspire the church to live the gospel faithfully in every age, the saints are fundamental to Christian self-understanding. But what is the relationship of the saints to the task of theology, or, perhaps even more curiously, to the task of philosophy?

Through the thought of Hans Urs von Balthasar, Matthew Rothaus Moser explores this question. He argues that, among other things, the saints offer a particular "form" for the way in which theology, and even philosophy, should be approached. The particular "form" offered by the saints is one of love. Love, as Moser's Balthasarian inspired vision understands it, is defined, in part, by a human being's *receptive openness* to Being and, ultimately, to God. Love is further articulated as an *obedient response* of prayerful dialogue between the human being and all of reality, which has the potential to bear *fruit*. The fruit of an obedient response to God and to Being is *understanding*: a deepened understanding of the mystery of God and of Being, as well as an understanding of how one should "be" in the world. That the saints exemplify this form of love, and that this form can lead to understanding, is the underlying thesis of Moser's work, which is pithily summed up by the title: *Love Itself is Understanding*.

Readers who engage with Moser's work will find it helpful for a number of reasons, two of which are worth mentioning here. First, primarily in chapters one through three, Moser provides a description of Balthasar as a theologian thoroughly informed by an "Ignatian" theological vision. It is Ignatius of Loyola who inspires Balthasar's understanding of the aforementioned saintly form of love. It is also Ignatius' thought which forms Balthasar's own mission as a

theologian. This mission, for Balthasar, is an attempt to “find God in all things,” and can be witnessed, for example, in Balthasar’s own academic pursuits as he engages with various forms of culture and thought.

Second, primarily in chapters four through seven, Moser provides a helpful summary of Balthasar’s *Theo-Logic*. This summary expounds the important contours of Balthasar’s understanding of truth. The “truth” of reality, that is, the truth of Being, is best understood, according to Balthasar, through a Trinitarian analysis of Being. This analysis shows that the truth of Being is love: the love revealed by God in Jesus Christ and through the Holy Spirit. And since the truth of Being is love, then it (Being) is best approached, through the guidance of the Holy Spirit, by the form of love that is exemplified in the saints. Therefore, according to Moser’s reading of Balthasar, the saintly form of love is adequately suited to guide the process of both theology and philosophy, as both disciplines are concerned, in their respective manner, with the truth of Being.

If readers are looking for a critical or comparative engagement of Balthasar’s thought with either his direct critics, or with different metaphysical or epistemological visions that might nuance Balthasar’s own vision, Moser’s work may not completely satisfy them. Though this does occur in some places (e.g., via Balthasar’s analysis of Hegel), the main critical partner utilised in this book is Karen Kilby, and this is found primarily, though not exclusively, in the final chapter. This chapter serves as an insightful conclusion to the book, answering some of the questions posed by Kilby, and showing a more concrete example of how theology and philosophy might be approached through the “saintly” form of love.

Robert Aaron Wessman
KU Leuven

Michael L. Budde, ed. *Beyond the Borders of Baptism: Catholicity, Allegiances, and Lived Identities*. Studies in World Catholicism 1. Eugene, OR: Cascade, 2016. vii + 358 pp. \$42.00. ISBN 978-1-4982-0473-6.

In the book entitled *The Borders of Baptism: Identities, Allegiances, and the Church*, published in 2011, Michael L. Budde developed the notion of “ecclesial solidarity,” which means that one’s identity in Christ and church should take precedence within and redefine other human allegiances such as ethnicity, class, citizenship, race, or tribe (see the book review by Braden P. Anderson). Two years later, Budde, a professor of Catholic Studies and Political Science at DePaul University in the U.S., invited various theologians to discuss the matters raised in his book, i.e., to explore “theological, political, and pastoral issues related to the Catholic encounter with processes and institutions that form politically salient loyalties and identities in the modern and post-modern world” (3). The proceedings from that conference resulted in this collection, alluringly entitled *Beyond the Borders of Baptism*, which is the first volume of the new book series *Studies in World Catholicism*, published by Cascade Books.

In three parts and seventeen chapters, Budde gives voice to seventeen different authors, including himself, in order to present the complex dynamics and

tension between, as the subtitle of the book suggests, *Catholicity, Allegiances, and Lived Identities*. This praiseworthy and theologically needed collection of essays covers the broad geographical spectrum of manifestations and case studies within Catholicism (or rather Christianity, as I will comment on later) and interprets them using a political-theological key.

Part One, entitled “Identities, Allegiances, and Theological Reflections,” was co-authored by three renowned theologians who provide the introductory remarks on the topic. In chapter 1, Emanuel Katongole conceptualises his theology “after Rwanda” and asks provocatively, “does the blood of tribalism run deeper than the waters of baptism?” (14) to point out that the “new we,” as the universal discipleship of Christ, takes precedence over different types of belonging. Furthermore, Dorian Llywelyn, SJ, offers his view on how to reconcile the collective and individual natures of one’s identity using the images of the relationship within the Trinity. He claims that “the coincidence of opposites – unity of nature and difference of persons – exemplified par excellence in the metaphysics of the Trinity, presents itself as the ideal of a series of analogous relationships, secular as well as religious,” (38) from which it follows that “in each of these binaries, difference and unity should balance each other” (39). As the last in this part, Stanley Hauerwas in the chapter “Church Matters” wants to dismiss the “and” between theology *and* politics, using the life and theology of Karl Barth as an inspiration. For Hauerwas, “Christ’s humanity means no account of the church is possible that does not require material expression that is rightly understood as a politic. Church matters matter not only for the church; we believe that what is a necessity for the church is a possibility for all that is not the church” (62).

If the first part is reflexive, the second part is rather down-to-earth and mostly based on particular case studies with contributors from five continents and divided into sections accordingly. As stated in the title, the purpose of this part is to explore “History, Context, Theology, and Eschatology: Notes, Experiences, Suggestions, and Possibilities.” The section on Europe has six contributions, Africa, Latin America, and North America have two contributions each, while Asia only has one. In the part on Europe, several chapters stand out. Alexander Stumwoll in chapter 5 writes from the point of view of a young intellectual on the challenges of being a Catholic in contemporary Europe. Capably providing an historical analysis of secularisation in Europe, and explaining the “conservative vs. liberal” Catholic rift in Europe after Vatican II, Stumwoll believes that “it would not come as a surprise to see American-style culture wars enter into a European context” (89) and suggests that “the Church in Europe must not become a scared subculture but a sacred counterculture” (90). What personally brought my attention to this book – coming from the ex-Yugoslav region where, in the 1990s, a close alliance between religious and national identity proved to be catastrophic – was chapter 7 by Slavica Jakelić, who discusses interesting examples *vis-à-vis* nationalist and anti-nationalist Catholic groups from Poland and Bosnia-Herzegovina. For example, she contrasts two Franciscan communities from the same country and demonstrated that “if the Bosnian War brought to light the exclusivistic character of religious nationalism of the Medugorje (Herzegovinian) Franciscans, it also pointed to the peacemaking and tolerant Catholicism of the Bosnian Franciscans” (117), an astonishing fact which is far from evident for an outside observer. Proof that

this book extends beyond Catholicism is a contribution by Orthodox scholar Pantelis Kalaitzidis from Greece, who explores nationalistic sentiments within the Greek Orthodox Church in chapter 9, "Baptismal and Ethnocultural Community: A Case Study of Greek Orthodoxy." In chapter 10, Abgonkhanmeghe E. Orobator, SJ, presents "African Cases and Theological Reflections," underlining that in Africa, perhaps more than anywhere else in the world, "to be Catholic is to define one's self always in relation to a multiplicity of faith traditions and denominations" (168). William Cavanaugh writes in chapter 15 about an issue in his field of expertise, namely how far can one speak of nationalism and Catholicism as religions. Influenced by the US example, he sharply warns that "denying that nationalism is a religion keeps us from seeing the idolatrous tendencies in our reverence for the nation and national symbols. On the other hand, affirming that Catholicism is a religion has a tendency to marginalize it from the public sphere" (265). As a result, once relegated to the private domain, it is wrongly assumed that Catholicism "cannot conflict with allegiance to the nation" (265).

The third part, "In Lieu of a Conclusion," was written by the editor of this volume. Budde envisages his idea of an inclusive church that embraces people regardless of their loyalties, and occasionally links his reflection to those of other authors elsewhere in the volume. He uses biblical references extensively to illustrate "dead ends to avoid" (304-310), e.g., that family metaphors cannot be used to illustrate Christian discipleship, or that patriotism can be said to be a better version of nationalism. Instead, Budde highlights "a few open doors worth exploring" (310-318), like the demoting of social and nationalistic allegiances from their elevated position, the role of Christian formation and inculturation, culminating in "a final door" (318-321) which is the Eucharist itself.

Overall, what makes this book unique is the variety of theological-political case studies from various geographical regions and historical periods, only selectively reviewed here due to the constraints of space (other chapters include case studies from Germany [chapter 6], Ukraine [8], Kenya [11], Mexico [13], the US [14], the Philippines [16], Europe [4], and Latin America [12]). Most of the contributors provide ample evidence of what happens when "profane" loyalties become "sacralised." Thus, it is not only just another theological exploration, but also, in many ways, a call for action.

Regarding the formatting, it would have been more practical if each author provided a bibliography after each chapter instead of having one extensive thirty-page bibliography at the end of the book. Moreover, because there are a variety of contributing authors, it would have been helpful if Budde had provided a short biography for each contributor to this volume as well. It also remains unclear why the subtitle stressed Catholicity if the book is not exclusively Catholic in either its content or its contributions.

Nevertheless, this book is undoubtedly to be recommended, especially to those interested in a relationship between nationalism and religion, but also to scholars and students interested in political theology, particularly in the political implications of ecclesiology and Christian ethics in its manifold theoretical and practical guises. Indeed, another practical proof that this book challenges the right point at the right time is the fact that there were supposed to be two more contributions in the book, but the authors could not revise their manuscripts due to conflict situations in their respective countries. This book is therefore

Budde's second call radically to reconsider a personal, lived Christian identity in order to understand how it relates to other spheres of belonging, and finally, which of these ought to take priority.

Goran Stanic
KU Leuven

Thomas Banchoff and José Casanova, eds. *The Jesuits and Globalization: Historical Legacies and Contemporary Challenges*. Washington, DC: Georgetown University Press, 2016. viii + 299 pp. \$23.00. ISBN 978-1-62616-286-0.

Organised and edited by faculty at Georgetown University, this collection of essays is the fruit of three workshops held in Washington, Oxford, and Florence. Focusing more on Jesuit contributions to various kinds of globalisation than on globalisation's effects on the Jesuits, the volume, in its editors' introduction, argues that the Society of Jesus, past and present, "confounds and complicates simple, unambiguous narratives and one-dimensional, unilinear theories of globalization" (21).

Strengths of the essays include a clear distinction between Jesuits that cooperated with and were happy to be part of Spanish, or Portuguese, or other European imperial and colonial endeavours, and Jesuits who resisted such agendas, and fought for respect of local cultures and peoples. The Jesuits were from the beginning an international organisation, one that transcended national boundaries, and thus one that was (and still is) often in tension with nationalism, even if some individual Jesuits embrace, uncritically, nationalist priorities at odds with Jesuit ideals and ways of proceeding. Some U.S. Jesuits even voted for Donald Trump in the 2016 presidential election, much to the horror and disgust of many of their confrères. Among the most articulate essays here are those by John McGreevy, John O'Malley, and Peter Balleis, all of which offer important perspectives on Jesuit promotion of an international culture and ethos. Balleis embraces an unbridled optimism on Jesuit use of the internet and online education as a way of recovering and redirecting a tradition of Jesuit education offered free of charge.

When Jesuits (and their friends and colleagues) write about Jesuits there can be the risk of being overly critical of their subject, and there can be the opposite risk of engaging in something close to hagiography. David Hollenbach's essay, on pursuit of the more universal good as central to Jesuit ministries since Vatican II, is perhaps as much a victory bulletin as anything else. Hollenbach seems very satisfied with what has been done in this area. His praise of John O'Malley's book *The First Jesuits* as a "definitive study" (178) echoes such satisfaction, though I, as an historian in a field close to that of O'Malley, always tell my students that there is no such thing as a definitive study of anything, and especially not in religious history.

Some topics important to the volume's themes are given short shrift if any attention at all. Though Africa looms increasing large on maps of where one finds Jesuit today, the continent is largely absent from discussions here, and

there is no attention to the recently created Jesuit Historical Institute of Africa in Nairobi. In this book there is also no engagement with Jesuit visual culture, in any time or place, even though images are one of the ways in which Jesuits managed to reach across the barriers of language differences, in places such as seventeenth-century Canada or Latin America. For the restored Society, post-1814, photography and films would become an important instrument of communication, evangelization, and globalization; one needs to look elsewhere than this volume for such matters.

How European understandings and misunderstandings of the rest of the world have been challenged through published accounts of Jesuit experiences in “Indies” of various kinds is a topic meriting more attention than is given here. For centuries, the printing press allowed literate Europeans to learn a good deal about other continents, and Jesuit publications played a major role in this. Today, one might ask how Francis, the Jesuit pope, is shaping various kinds of globalisation and global consciousness, as he communicates with the entire world through electronic media and frequent travel. Or to what extent is his encyclical *Laudato si'* not only a call to respectful engagement with creation but also a call to global awareness of the fragile nature of the environment in which we all live? And was the very election of a Latin American pope a key moment in the globalisation of the Catholic Church, a globalisation in which the Society of Jesus continues to play a central role?

Thomas Worcester, SJ
Regis College, Toronto

Jason Reimer Greig. *Reconsidering Intellectual Disability: L'Arche, Medical Ethics, and Christian Friendship*. The Moral Tradition Series. Washington, DC: Georgetown University Press, 2015. vii + 293 pp. \$32.95, €32.54 (paperback); \$59.95, €57.77 (hardcover). ISBN 978-1-62616-243-3.

Reconsidering Intellectual Disability addresses persons with disabilities, and those who care for and reflect theoretically upon disability from an ethical, theological, and philosophical perspective. It has implications for ecclesiology, liturgical studies, bioethics, medical practice, and political philosophy.

This work is driven by the author's personal distress after learning of the details of what has now been termed the Ashley Treatment, AT. This refers to a series of treatments performed in 2004 upon a six-year old girl in the U.S. who had been diagnosed at birth as having static encephalopathy, or severe brain damage, which had resulted in numerous profound disabilities. On the eve of what appeared to be an early onset of her puberty, the treatments were started at the request of Ashley's parents in collaboration with Seattle Children's Hospital, and were aimed at permanently stunting Ashley's growth to limit possible discomfort that could arise with puberty and to make it easier for her parents to carry her around. The treatments included growth attenuation oestrogen therapy, removal of her breast buds, a hysterectomy, and an appendectomy.

This book seeks to uncover the hidden anthropological assumptions at work within the AT narrative, place the person with disabilities in all her

embodiment at the centre of theological reflections, and argue for the full moral status of such persons within the context of Christian friendship.

To begin his argument, Greig, in chapter one, details the AT case, describing Ashley's embodiment, her parents' motivations, and the arguments both for and against the AT, drawn largely from the fields of bioethics and disability. Of note was the argument that "relieving pain" (29) should take precedence over human dignity rhetoric, which was not applicable to Ashley who lacked the capacities of autonomy and personal respect upon which human dignity is premised. Greig concludes this chapter with some fundamental questions about the wider implications of the AT. These questions about the method of moral reasoning and what it means to be human guide Greig's investigation in subsequent chapters.

In chapter two, Greig draws insights from Christian ethicist Gerald McKenny, naming the underlying narrative of the AT as the modern medical narrative of the "Baconian project," based on the utopic thought of Francis Bacon. Greig explains that the project, which was aimed at "eliminating suffering and [expanding] human choice" (53), resulted in the belief that all nature is instrumental and the ideal human being is an autonomous choosing self. In this framework, Ashley is pathologised, objectified, and stripped of all moral status.

Chapter three concerns the social model of disability as an alternative to the Baconian medical narrative, but concentrates mostly on its limitations. Interestingly, it is the early disability theologies of Nancy Eiesland and Sharon Betcher that Greig primarily uses to highlight the weaknesses of this model. While praising both works for calling attention back to the bodies of the disabled, he simultaneously critiques them for their continued commitment to the autonomous self-determining self which forms the grounds for social participation in their liberation theology frameworks. Greig calls for a participation based on friendship, not autonomy.

Greig then turns in chapter four to the Christian tradition as an alternative model for conceiving of and understanding disability. He looks at the theological, biblical, and philosophical approaches to friendship and uses an extensive array of sources to ground Christian friendship in the conception of the human *telos* as friendship with God, further establishing it as ecstatic and identifying it as *philia* where "the lover loves the beloved for the sake of the relationship" (118). Greig's exegesis of John 15 illustrates how Christ made friendship normative for relations in the community. The foot washing event of this pericope is upheld as the supreme exemplary act of *philia*, which illustrates its receptive and mutual character. Greig concludes his argument by asserting Christian friendship as a replacement for the Aristotelian ideal of friendship between equals.

Chapter 5 locates this *philia* in community, specifically the Body of Christ. This community also constitutes an alternative political community grounded in the Christian narrative in which selfhood is story-formed, ecclesial, and dependent upon and received through the social recognition of friendship. This narrative is accompanied by a counter-politics of dependence emphasised through the enactment of specific practices which take on a sacramental nature within the Body of Christ. Foot washing stands out as a fundamental sacramental practice continually forming the identities of members as friends through its

rite of touch. The rite commemorates the mutuality of friendship received from God and ushers in God's eschatological hospitality of welcome to all.

Greig's final chapter concretises his case for Christian friendship and the rite of foot washing in the actual example of the L'Arche communities for persons with disabilities. Greig, as a former L'Arche assistant, grounds L'Arche's narrative in the personal narrative of its founder, Jean Vanier, illustrating how Vanier's initial insights now work to create a culture in L'Arche of which foot washing constitutes a major part. These insights include the recognition of weakness as fundamental to the human condition and the need to see the body as sacramental and approach it in tenderness. In L'Arche's foot washing, both disabled and non-disabled members attest to a counterculture of patience, compassion, and tenderness especially visible when those with the most profound disabilities wash others' feet.

Where Greig falls short is in his narrative approach which remains slightly underdeveloped. In Greig's advancement of L'Arche's foot washing practices, the reader is not provided with much in terms of actual stories to ground Greig's arguments. While Vanier's narrative features prominently, few examples are offered of how this narrative has actually been sustained. A greater incorporation of the stories of assistants and core members may have been more helpful, especially since the difficulties of living as a community of friends might have been addressed in a more profound way. Secondly, Greig's contribution to disability discourse could have been helped by referring to how the Christian tradition has been influenced by the modernity project. In this regard, disability theologian Hans Reinders' exposition of the ways in which fundamental tenets of Christianity have been interpreted in a modernist vein, resulting in the exclusion of persons with profound disabilities (a discussion which appears in his *Receiving the Gift of Friendship: Profound Disability, Theological Anthropology and Ethics*) might have proven helpful. This, I believe, safeguards against future theological contributions repeating former errors and allows for the critical humility needed to engage in disability discourse.

Greig's contribution to the fields of bioethics and disability theology is noteworthy, however. Particularly through his use of the narrative method (albeit underdeveloped), Greig moves discussions beyond the original issue of the AT to the implications for humanity as a whole. This is an effective tool in bridging the gap between those with and without disabilities and allows for a more authentic representation of those without the capacity for self-representation. Greig follows in the steps of others like John Swinton who have used this method effectively. Also remarkable is Greig's advocacy of liturgy as a tool of inclusion. Greig's specific innovation lies in his interpretation of the foot washing rite as inherently inclusive. This improves upon suggestions within Christian settings that tend to call for separate liturgies or serious adaptations to present liturgies as ways to include those with profound disabilities.

Adanna James
KU Leuven